



CYMDEITHAS DDYSGEDIG CYMRU THE LEARNED SOCIETY OF WALES

Guidance for Medals and Awards Scrutiny Committees

In advance:

1. Each nomination you receive will be submitted with a completed nomination form, a reference and confirmation of the candidate / team's consent to be nominated.
2. Some nominations may also include a 'Career Impact' statement that will be completed by the candidate / team being nominated. If submitted, the candidate / team will indicate if this can be shared with the full committee or if they prefer it to only be viewed by the Chair (or Vice Chair in their absence) who will consider the impact of this information on the nomination information and share their considerations and NOT the content of the statement with the Scrutiny Committee when they meet.
3. The Medals and Awards Scrutiny Committee will receive the relevant nominations in advance of their agreed meeting date with time to read and consider.
4. Please familiarise yourself with the [LSW position on EDI and Equity](#) in particular.
5. To aid the scrutiny process, contact emails for each member of the scrutiny committee will be circulated to other committee members

Attendance at Scrutiny Committee meetings:

6. Impact Scrutiny Committee:

Quorum at the Impact Scrutiny Committee is four (4). This can be any combination of Fellows and Honorary Fellows.

If any member of a Scrutiny Committee finds they are unable to attend, they should contact LSW staff to inform them as soon as possible before the meeting takes place.

The following processes can then be followed:

- a) If there is sufficient time to recruit a replacement, the Chair (or Vice Chair if needed) will be asked to appoint a relevant individual. This can be from the Expressions of Interest previously received in the first instance and from the wider Fellowship where required.

If there is not time to recruit a replacement:

- b) The meeting may go ahead and all decisions deemed valid if a total of 3 (Fellows and/or Honorary Fellows) are present and they have received written input from the Fellow unable to attend. Input should include their scores and any other input to be received and shared with the committee as soon as possible before the meeting takes place.

If it is not possible to receive input from the Fellow unable to attend:

- c) The meeting may be re-arranged to another date to ensure that quorum can be achieved – including recruiting new members if necessary.

7. Early Career Scrutiny Committee & Established Career Scrutiny Committee:

Quorum at each of these Scrutiny Committee is four (4). This can be any combination of Fellows and Researcher Development Advisory Group members.

If any member of a Scrutiny Committee finds they are unable to attend, they should contact LSW staff to inform them as soon as possible.

The following processes can then be followed:

- a) If there is sufficient time to recruit a replacement, the Chair (or Vice Chair if needed) will be asked appoint a relevant individual. This can be from the Expressions of Interest previously received in the first instance and from the wider Fellowship where required.

If there is not time to recruit a replacement:

- b) The meeting may go ahead and all decisions deemed valid if a total of 4 (Fellows and/or Researcher Development Advisory Group members) are present and they have received written input from one individual unable to attend. Input should include their scores and any other input to be received and shared with the committee as soon as possible before the meeting takes place

If it is not possible to receive input from the individual unable to attend:

- c) The meeting may be re-arranged to another date to ensure that quorum can be achieved – including recruiting new members if necessary.

During the Scrutiny Committee meeting:

- 8. Each Medals and Awards Scrutiny Committee will be supported by the attendance of an 'Independent Member' Fellow to provide an additional layer of scrutiny and support particularly with regard to EDI considerations.

9. Medals and Awards Scrutiny Committees are tasked with considering the nominations received and determining which is most worthy of winning the appropriate medal or award.
10. The Medals and Awards Scrutiny Committee reserves the right to not award a medal or award if they feel they have not received nominations of sufficient quality.
11. Each nomination should be allocated equal time for consideration and deliberation.
12. A scoring framework will be provided to facilitate discussion and capture decisions made. Committees may complete it with one combined score or instead, do so individually and then combine the scores.
13. The scoring framework includes collectively agreed definitions for key requirements in the process.
14. All members of Scrutiny Committees will all have equal voting rights (with the exception of the Independent Member).
15. An LSW staff member will attend each meeting for the purpose of recording decisions, completing the final scoring framework and to support as appropriate.
16. Written feedback is required for all non-successful nominations to the Dillwyn medals that can be provided to the candidate (Early Career Researchers) via their nominator.
17. Final scoring sheets should be presented to the relevant LSW staff to process and contact nominators and candidates as appropriate.
18. Conflicts of interest should be declared:
 - a. All members will assess the list of nominees for their scrutiny committee in advance of the meeting to identify any conflict of interest. They will inform LSW staff where identified.
 - b. If the Chair has a conflict of interest with a nomination, the Vice-Chair will lead the evaluation of that nomination and the Chair will not take part in that individuals' discussion.
 - c. In all cases, conflicted member(s) may not participate in, or influence, the decision or any vote on the relevant nomination; they must also withdraw from the meeting during the discussion and scoring.
 - d. A committee member who knows a nominee must not add any personal knowledge about that individual that is not declared on the nomination forms but may comment on what is written on the nomination form if invited to do so by the chair.
 - e. At each committee meeting, the Chair will call for declarations of interest again before members begin to review nominations. Members must declare any interests of the type covered above, or any other relevant interest in a nomination if not already done so.